Article

Safety Assessment of Achillea millefolium as Used in Cosmetics

International Journal of Toxicology 2016, Vol. 35(Supplement 3) 5S-15S © The Author(s) 2016 Reprints and permission: sagepub.com/journalsPermissions.nav DOI: 10.1177/1091581816677717 journals.sagepub.com/home/ijt

\$SAGE

Lillian C. Becker¹, Wilma F. Bergfeld², Donald V. Belsito², Ronald A. Hill², Curtis D. Klaassen², Daniel C. Liebler², James G. Marks Jr², Ronald C. Shank², Thomas J. Slaga², Paul W. Snyder², and F. Alan Andersen³

Abstract

Cosmetic ingredients derived from Achillea millefolium function in cosmetics as skin-conditioning agents—miscellaneous, skin-conditioning agents—humectants, and fragrance ingredients. The Cosmetic Ingredient Review Expert Panel (Panel) reviewed relevant animal and human data to determine their safety in cosmetics and raised concerns about cosmetics containing linalool, thujone, quercetin, hydroquinone, or α -peroxyachifolid. Because final product formulations may contain multiple botanicals, each containing similar constituents of concern, formulators are advised to be aware of these components and to avoid reaching levels that may be hazardous to consumers. Additionally, industry was advised to use good manufacturing practices to limit impurities. The Panel concluded that achillea millefolium extract, achillea millefolium flower/leaf/stem extract are safe in the present practices of use and concentration in cosmetics when formulated to be nonsensitizing.

Keywords

achillea millefolium, cosmetics, safety, yarrow

Introduction

This amended report assesses the safety of *Achillea millefolium* (yarrow)-derived ingredients as used in cosmetics. The ingredients in this report are achillea millefolium extract, achillea millefolium flower/leaf/stem extract, and achillea millefolium flower extract. These ingredients function in cosmetics as skin-conditioning agents—miscellaneous, skin-conditioning agents—humectants, and fragrance ingredients (Table 1).¹

In 2001, Cosmetic Ingredient Review (CIR) published its original safety assessment of achillea millefolium extract as used in cosmetics,² concluding that the data reviewed were insufficient to determine the safety of this ingredient. Since that earlier review, additional data were provided and are presented with newly published data in this report. The Expert Panel (Panel) considered both sets of data when evaluating the safety of the *A millefolium* (yarrow)-derived ingredients.

The ingredient names are written as listed above, without italics and without abbreviations. When referring to the plant from which these ingredients are derived, the taxonomic practice of using italics and abbreviating the genus will be followed (eg, *A millefolium*).

Chemistry

Definition

The definitions and functions of *A millefolium*-derived cosmetic ingredients are listed in Table 1. *Achillea millefolium* is an herbaceous plant with characteristic narrow, oblong, multiple pinnate leaves.³ The flower heads are small, made up of 5 white or pink florets with a few yellow tubular florets. The plant grows to \sim 70-cm tall. *Achillea millefolium* is a member of the Asteraceae (formerly Compositae) family, which is known to be sensitizing.⁴

Corresponding Author:

Lillian J. Gill, Cosmetic Ingredient Review, 1620 L Street, NW, Suite, 1200, Washington, DC 20036, USA.

Email: cirinfo@cir-safety.org

Cosmetic Ingredient Review Scientific Analyst/Writer, Washington, DC, USA

² Cosmetic Ingredient Review Expert Panel Member, Washington, DC, USA

³ Former Director, Cosmetic Ingredient Review, Washington, DC, USA

Table 1. CAS Nos., Definitions, and Functions of Achillea millefolium-Derived Ingredients.

Ingredient	Definition	Function
Achillea millefolium extract 84082- 83-7	The extract of the whole yarrow plant, A millefolium	Fragrance ingredient, skin-conditioning agent— miscellaneous
Achillea millefolium flower extract	The extract of the flowers of the yarrow plant, A millefolium	Antioxidants, skin-conditioning agent—humectant
Achillea millefolium flower/leaf/stem extract	The extract of the flowers, leaves, and stems of the yarrow plant, A millefolium	Skin-conditioning agent— miscellaneous

Physical and Chemical Properties

UV absorbance of a 1% aqueous water achillea millefolium extract peaked at ~ 260 nm with small shoulders at 270 and ~ 320 nm.⁵

Constituents. The constituents of *A millefolium* are listed in Table 2. A sample of an achillea millefolium extract (aqueous) mixture (water 73.5%, butylene glycol 20%, pentylene glycol 5%, achillea millefolium extract 1%, xanthan gum 0.5%) contained 3.37% polyphenols, 61.25% proteins, and 38.12% sugars.⁵ An assay for nitrogen compounds of the same sample showed the possible presence of pipecolic acid, L-alanine, and phenylalanine but not betaine, betonicine, betaine HCl, trigonelline, and stachydrine HCl. An analysis for phenolic compounds detected luteolin (a few ppm) and apigenin but not gallic acid, chlorogenic acid, caffeic acid, coumaric acid, kaempferol, and quercetin. Another assay for terpenes and steroids, including thujone, guaiazulene, ursolic acid, and β-sitosterol, was negative. Coumarin was not detected.

β-sitosterol, 3β-hydroxy-11α,13-dihydro-costunolide, desacetylmatricarin, leucodin, achillin, 8α-angeloxy-leucodin, and 8α-angeloxy-achillin were isolated from the flower heads of *A millefolium* plants.⁶

The essential oil content of *A millefolium* was lower in the vegetative stage (0.13%) than the full bloom stage (0.34%). Changes in the content of essential oil was found to be related to the maturation of the plant, with increasing amounts of monoterpenes in relation to the sesquiterpene as the plant matures. However, a clear trend could be detected only for the monoterpenic compounds with increasing levels of α - and β -pinene and α -thujone and decreasing levels of sabinene, borneol, and bornyl acetate. Previously reported as major compounds, chamazulene and germacrene D could be found only in trace amounts. The terpenic compounds (sesquiterpenic compounds such as β -bisabolene, α -bisabolol, and δ -cadinene) were detected in greater amounts when using solid-phase microextraction when compared to amounts found in steam-distilled samples.

Gas chromatography-mass spectrometry analysis of the essential oil of *A millefolium* identified 36 compounds

Table 2. Constituents of Achillea millefolium. 10

Chemical	Part	Range (ppm)
Essential oil	Flower	700-5,000
Thiophenes	Flower	167
(E)-nerolidol	Leaf	
1,8-cineole	Leaf	24-1,680
8-acetylagelolide	Leaf	
Alloocimene	Leaf	4-140
α-bisabolol	Leaf	1-915
α -cadinol	Leaf	1-15
α -copaene	Leaf	
α -curcumene	Leaf	
α -humulene	Leaf	
α -muurolene	Leaf	
α -phellandrene	Leaf	
α-pinene	Leaf	1-1,000
α-terpinene	Leaf	2-1,120
α-terpineol	Leaf	1-80
α-thujene	Leaf	
α -thujone	Leaf	3-240
Artemisia-alcohol	Leaf	I-80
Artemisia-ketone	Leaf	
Artemisiatriene	Leaf	1-65
Ascaridole	Leaf	120-6,600
Ascaridole-isomer	Leaf	5-335
Ascorbic acid	Leaf	580-3,100
Azulene	Leaf	0-8,000
β-Caryophyllene	Leaf	1-65
β-Caryophyllene oxide	Leaf	1-30
β-Cubebene	Leaf	1-15
β -Elemene	Leaf	
β -Farnesene	Leaf	
β-Pinene	Leaf	1-720
β -Thujone	Leaf	I-30
Borneol	Leaf	6-275
Camphene	Leaf	2-600
Camphor	Leaf	20-2,880
Carvacrol	Leaf	
Caryophyllene	Leaf	4-160
Chrysanthenyl acetate	Leaf	
<i>ci</i> s-chrysanthenone	Leaf	I-30
cis-dehydromatricaria ester	Leaf	
<i>ci</i> s-jasmone	Leaf	2-125
cis-sabinene hydrate	Leaf	I-80
Copaene	Leaf	1.5-60
Cuminaldehyde	Leaf	0.3-11
Deacetylmatricaine	Leaf	
δ -4-carene	Leaf	
δ cadinene	Leaf	0.2-8
Desacetylmatricin	Leaf	
Dihydroparthenolide	Leaf	
Essential oil	Leaf	250-16,000
Folic acid	Leaf	
γ -Cadinene	Leaf	
γ -Terpinene	Leaf	9-370
Geranial	Leaf	1-50
Germacrene-D	Leaf	
Humulene	Leaf	0.5-22
Isoartemisia-ketone	Leaf	20-16,000
Isoborneol	Leaf	5-320
-		

(continued)

Becker et al 7S

Table 2. (continued)

Table 2. (continued)

able 2. (continued)			lable 2. (continued)		
Chemical	Part	Range (ppm)	Chemical	Part	Range (ppm)
Lavandulol	Leaf	1-15	Butyric acid	Plant	
Limonene	Leaf	1-170	Caffeic acid	Plant	
Linalool	Leaf	1-4,000	Calcium	Plant	1,535-8,670
Linoleic acid	Leaf		Campherenone	Plant	70
Myrcene	Leaf	0.5-20	Capric acid methyl ester	Plant	
Octen-3-ol	Leaf		Caprylic acid methyl ester	Plant	
p-Cymene	Leaf	9-1,185	Carbohydrates	Plant	133,104-752,000
Sabinene	Leaf	1-1,225	Casticin	Plant	
Saponins	Leaf		Cerotinic acid	Plant	
Succinic acid	Leaf		Chamazulene	Plant	0-4,845
T-cadinol	Leaf	1-15	Chamazulene carboxylic acid	Plant	
Terpinen-4-ol	Leaf	3-175	Chlorogenic acid	Plant	
Terpinolene	Leaf	1-50	Choline	Plant	
Thiophenes Thiophenes	Leaf	167	Chromium	Plant	0.4-2.5
Thymol	Leaf	1-15	Cineole	Plant	
Trans-dehydromatricaria ester	Leaf		cis-β-Farnesene	Plant	110
Tricyclene	Leaf	0.6-27	cis-Carveol	Plant	200
Yomogi alcohol	Leaf	5-270	cis-nerolidol	Plant	230
(-)-Betonicine	Plant		cis-Sabinol	Plant	100
(-)-Viburnitol	Plant		Cobalt	Plant	0.6-3.1
2,3-dehydroxydesacetoxymatricin	Plant		Cosmosiin	Plant	
2,3-dihydroacetoxymatricin	Plant		Coumarins	Plant	3,500
2-pentyl-5-propylresorcinol	Plant	70	Dextrose	Plant	,,,,,,,
3-oxaguaianolide	Plant		Dulcitol	Plant	
4-oxo-3,4-dihydro-2,3-diazaphenoxanthin		36	Essential oil	Plant	177-14,000
5-hydroxy-3,6,7,4'-tetramethoxyflavone	Plant		Eucalyptol	Plant	,
6,10,14-trimethyl-pentadecan-2-one	Plant	32	Eugenol	Plant	
8-acetocyartabsin	Plant		Farnesene	Plant	
8-anelooxyartabsin	Plant		Fat	Plant	7,080-40,000
Acetylbalchanolide	Plant		Ferulic acid	Plant	.,
Achiceine	Plant		Fiber	Plant	69,000-201,000
Achilleine	Plant		Fiber (crude)	Plant	69,000
Achilletine	Plant		Fiber (dietary)	Plant	412,000
Achillicin	Plant		Folacin	Plant	,
Achillin	Plant		Formic acid	Plant	
Aconitic acid	Plant		Furfural	Plant	
Adenine	Plant		Furfuryl alcohol	Plant	
α-patchoulene	Plant	90	Galactose	Plant	
α-peroxyachifolide	Plant		Gallic acid	Plant	
Aluminum	Plant	6-34	Geranyl acetate	Plant	36
Apigenin	Plant	• • •	Glucose	Plant	
Apigenin-7-0-glucoside	Plant		Glutamic acid	Plant	
Arabinose	Plant		Glycine	Plant	
Artemitin	Plant		Guaiazulene	Plant	
Ascorbic acid	Plant	119-672	Heptadecane	Plant	
Ash	Plant	17,700-125,000	Histidine	Plant	
Asparagine	Plant	.7,700 123,000	Homostachydrine	Plant	
Austricin	Plant		Hydroquinone	Plant	
Balchanolide	Plant		Hydroxyachillin	Plant	
Balchanolide Balchanolide acetate	Plant		Inositol	Plant	
Baicharionde acetate Benzaldehydecyanhydringlycoside	Plant		Inulin	Plant	
β -Carotene	Plant		Iron	Plant	
β-Himachalene	Plant	50	Isobutyl acetate	Plant	
ρ-minachaiene β-Sitosterol	Plant	30	Isorhamnetin	Plant	
•			Isoschaftoside	Plant	
β-Sitosterol acetate	Plant Plant		Isoschattoside Isovaleric acid	Plant Plant	
Betaine Petanisina					2 000
Betonicine	Plant	F0	Kilocalories	Plant	2,900
Bornyl acetate	Plant	50	Leucodin	Plant	

(continued) (continued)

Table 2. (continued)

Table 2. (continued)		
Chemical	Part	Range (ppm)
Linoleic acid ethyl ester	Plant	
Linoleic acid methyl ester	Plant	
Linolenic acid methyl ester	Plant	
Luteolin	Plant	
Luteolin-7-0-beta-D-glucopyranoside	Plant	
Luteolin-7-0-glucoside	Plant	
Lysine	Plant	
Magnesium	Plant	340-1,920
Maltose	Plant	
Mandelic acid	Plant	
Mandelonitrile glucoside	Plant	
Manganese	Plant	I-5
Mannitol	Plant	
Matricin	Plant	0
Menthol	Plant	
Millefin	Plant	
Millefolide	Plant	
Moschatine	Plant	
Myristic acid	Plant	
Neryl acetate	Plant	28
Niacin	Plant	
Niacin	Plant	
Oleic acid	Plant	
Palmitic acid	Plant	
Palmitic acid ethyl ester	Plant	
Palmitic acid methyl ester	Plant	
Pentacosane	Plant	
Phenol	Plant	155
Phloroglucinol	Plant	
Phosphorus	Plant	522-2,950
Ponticaepoxide	Plant	
Potassium	Plant	3,151-17,800
Proazulene	Plant	
Prochamazulene	Plant	
Protein	Plant	19,116-144,000
Protocatechuic acid	Plant	
Prunasin	Plant	
Pyrocatechol	Plant	
Quercetin	Plant	
Quercetin glycoside	Plant	
Quercitrin	Plant	
Resin	Plant	6,000
Riboflavin	Plant	1-6
Rutin	Plant	
Salicylic acid	Plant	0014
Selenium	Plant	0.3-1.6
Silicon	Plant	1-4.5
Sodium	Plant	15-82
Spathulenol	Plant	495
Stachydrine	Plant	
Stearic acid	Plant	
Stigmasterol	Plant	
Sucrose	Plant	
Swertisin	Plant	
Tannic acid	Plant	20.000.40.000
Tannin	Plant	28,000-40,000
Terpineol	Plant	
Thiamin	Plant	

Table 2. (continued)

Chemical	Part	Range (ppm)	
Thiamine	Plant		
Thujone	Plant		
Tin	Plant	5-26	
Trans-carveol	Plant	150	
Trans-trans-farnesol	Plant	160	
Tricosane	Plant		
Trigonelline	Plant		
Undecylenic acid methyl ester	Plant		
Vanillic acid	Plant		
Vicenin-2-schaftoside	Plant		
Water	Plant	823,000	
Zinc	Plant		
Anacyclin	Root		
Fat	Seed	223,000-334,000	
Protein	Seed	286,000	

constituting 90.8% of the total oil. Eucalyptol, camphor, α -terpineol, β -pinene, and borneol comprised 60.7% of the oil.⁸

A comparison of the aerial parts of *A millefolium* plants that grew in the Indian Andes at altitudes of 1,600 and 2,850 m was conducted.⁹ Of the constituents tested, there was considerable overlap in the content ranges of the major constituents; for example: β -pinene (10.6%-17.7%), 1,8-cineole (3.0%-15.1%), and borneol (0.2%-12.1%).

Constituents of concern. Achillea millefolium is reported to contain linalool (1-4,000 ppm), thujone, quercetin, α -peroxyachifolid, and hydroquinone (Table 2). The potential adverse effects of exposures to these constituents are summarized in Table 3.

Method of Manufacture

Achillea millefolium extract is processed from the stem, leaves, and other aerial parts of the plant. Under controlled temperature, time, pressure, and pH conditions (not provided), the plant parts are milled before an aqueous extraction. The extract is filtered then combined with butylene glycol (preservative) and xanthan gum. Other solvents (eg, alcohols, propylene, butylene glycol), or series of solvents and additives (preservatives), have also been reported to be used in the extraction process.

Use

The safety of *A millefolium* (yarrow)-derived ingredients included in this safety assessment is evaluated based on data received from the US Food and Drug Administration (FDA) and the cosmetic industry on the expected use of these ingredients in cosmetics. Use frequencies of individual ingredients in cosmetics are collected from manufacturers and reported under cosmetic product category in FDA's Voluntary Cosmetic Registration Program (VCRP) database (Table 4).¹¹ Use concentration data are submitted by industry in response to surveys conducted by the Personal Care Products Council (Council) of maximum reported use concentrations, by product category.¹²

(continued)

Becker et al 9S

Table 3. Constituents of Concern in Achillea Millefolium.

Constituent	Effects	Reference
Linalool	Dermal sensitizer. Safe at up to 4.3% (20% in a consumer fragrance)	35
Thujone	α , β -Thujone was not mutagenic in the Ames test; in the micronucleus test, negative in male and positive in female mice; β -thujone: some evidence of carcinogenicity in male rats—significant incidence of cancers of the preputial gland in male rats given 25 mg/kg by gavage, and an increase in adrenal gland tumors in male rats may have been due to β -thujone; no increase in cancer incidence in female rats (up to 50 mg/kg by gavage) or male or female mice (up to 25 mg/kg by gavage); all rats treated with 50 mg/kg and all female mice treated with 25	
	mg/kg died. Neurological toxic effects; the suggested acceptable daily intake was 3-7 mg/kg/d α -Thujone acts like many naturally occurring and synthetic convulsive agents blocking γ -aminobutyric acid (GABA)-mediated inhibition, which has an excitatory effect on the brain. α -Thujone is a GABA type A receptor antagonist blocking GABA-mediated inhibition, which has an excitatory effect on the brain	38-40
	Consumption of alcohol containing 100 mg thujone/L had a negative effect on attention performance in human participants that was not with alcohol alone or alcohol containing 10 mg thujone/L	41
	Essential oils containing thujone caused central nervous system effects including tonic and clonic convulsions/ seizures in humans and in animals. In rodents, the seizures are often lethal	42
Quercetin	Positive genotoxic effect in an Ames assay	43
C	Consistently genotoxic in in vitro tests and in some in vivo studies of intraperitoneal (IP) exposures but was consistently nongenotoxic in oral exposure studies	44
Hydroquinone	Causes skin depigmentation. Prescriptions for medical skin lighteners start at 0.4%	45
α-Peroxyachifolid	Sensitizer to guinea pigs at 0.01%	46

Table 4. Frequency of Use According to Duration and Exposure of Achillea Millefolium Extract.^a

	Uses	Maximum concentration (%)	
Use type	Achillea millefolium extract ^b		
Total/range	135	0.000005-0.04	
Duration of use			
Leave-on	83	0.00001-0.04	
Rinse-off	47	0.000005-0.03	
Diluted for (bath) use	5	0.0001	
Exposure type			
Eye area	2	0.00002-0.03	
Incidental ingestion	NR	0.00001-0.01	
Incidental inhalation sprays	3	0.0001	
Incidental inhalation powders	3	0.00005	
Dermal contact	94	0.00002-0.04	
Deodorant (underarm)	NR	NR	
Hair noncoloring	40	0.000005-0.006	
Hair coloring	NR	0.00001-0.00002	
Nail	- 1	0.00002-0.0002	
Mucous membrane	- 11	0.00001-0.0001	
Baby	NR	NR	

Abbreviations: NR, not reported; Totals, rinse-off + leave-on product uses; VCRP, Voluntary Cosmetic Registration Program.

The VCRP had an entry for "achillea millefolium." It was assumed that this entry was actually "achillea millefolium extract," and data from that entry were combined with the extract data. 11

Achillea millefolium extract was reported to be used in 135 cosmetic products; these include 83 leave-on products and 47 rinse-off products. The extract was reported to be used up to

0.04% in leave-on products and up to 0.03% in rinse-off products. The extract is reported to be used in eye makeup products up to 0.03%, hair preparations up to 0.03%, lipstick up to 0.0001%, and skin care products up to 0.03%.

There was no use information reported for achillea millefolium flower extract or achillea millefolium flower/leaf/stem extract. Achillea millefolium extract was reported to be used in perfumes and face powders and could possibly be inhaled. This ingredient was reportedly used in face powders at concentrations up to 0.00005% and in perfumes up to 0.0001%. In practice, 95% to 99% of the droplets/particles released from cosmetic sprays have aerodynamic equivalent diameters >10 μ m, with propellant sprays yielding a greater fraction of droplets/particles <10 μ m compared with pump sprays. Therefore, most droplets/particles incidentally inhaled from cosmetic sprays would be deposited in the nasopharyngeal and thoracic regions of the respiratory tract and would not be respirable (ie, they would not enter the lungs) to any appreciable amount. Approximately 14,15

Toxicokinetics

Absorption, Distribution, Metabolism, and Excretion

No new toxicokinetics data were identified or made available for review. However, since botanical extracts are mixtures, toxicokinetic data would only have meaning for individual constituents of the extract, not for the extract as a whole.

Cytotoxicity

Achillea millefolium extract. A product containing an aqueous extract of *A millefolium* (5.0 μ L/mL) was not cytotoxic to L5178Y cells after 3 hours of incubation. ¹⁶

^aBecause each ingredient may be used in cosmetics with multiple exposure types, the sum of all exposure type uses may not equal the sum total uses.

^bThere was a VCRP entry for achillea millefolium with 3 shampoos listed. This was combined with achillea millefolium extract.

Toxicological Studies

Acute Toxicity

Dermal. Acute dermal toxicity data on A millefolium (yarrow)-derived ingredients were not found in the published literature, and no unpublished data were submitted.

Oral—Nonhuman

Achillea millefolium extract. The oral LD_{50} of the mixture containing an aqueous extract of *A millefolium* was reported to be >2,000 mg/kg in female rats.¹⁷ There were no mortalities when an aqueous *A millefolium* extract (10 g/kg; leaves, stalks, stems) was orally administered to male and female Wistar rats.¹⁸

Intraperitoneal

Achillea millefolium extract. There were no mortalities when an aqueous *A millefolium* extract (3 g/kg; leaves, stalks, stems) was intraperitoneally (IP) administered to male and female Wistar rats.¹⁸

Repeated dose toxicity

Dermal. Repeated dose dermal toxicity data on *A millefolium* (yarrow)-derived ingredients were not found in the published literature, and no unpublished data were submitted.

Oral-Nonhuman

Achillea millefolium extract. An aqueous A millefolium extract (0.3, 0.6, 1.2 g/kg/d; leaves, stalks, stems) orally administered to male and female Wistar rats (n = 10/sex) for 28 or 90 consecutive days produced no signs of toxicity. 18 The rats were observed for clinical signs and necropsied at the end of the treatment period or after a 30-day recovery period. All rats survived until the end of both treatment periods. Rats in both treatment time groups had mobility, reflex responses, muscular tone, and breathing patterns similar to rats in the control group treated with water. Weight gain was similar in all groups. There were no changes in organ weight observed, with the exception of a decrease in liver weights in females in the long-term/lowdose group, in males in the long-term/mid-dose group, and in both sexes in the mid-dose/long-term and high-dose/ short- and long-term groups. Histopathological examination was unremarkable. The authors concluded that the rats had no treatment-related toxicological or histopathological abnormalities.

An ethanol (60%) multiherb mixture (20 mg/kg/d) that included achillea millefolium extract (3.5%; 0.7 mg/kg), orally administered to CBA/HZb mice (n = 6) for up to 6 months, caused no clinical signs. ¹⁹ Body weights were similar to controls. No differences were observed in the spleen, kidney, testicles, or liver weights when compared to controls. There was an increase in the serum activity of aspartate aminotransferase on day 7 compared to the activities at 24 hours of treatment. The serum activity of alanine aminotransferase and the concentration of cholesterol did not change during the treatment period. The authors concluded that the test mixture was not

toxic to the liver, kidney, spleen, pancreas, testes, and lungs. This mixture also contained *Vaccinium myrtillus*, *Taraxacum officinale*, *Cichorium intybus*, *Juniperus communis*, *Centaurium umbellatum*, *Phaseolus vulgaris*, *Morus nigra*, *Valeriana officinalis*, and *Urtica dioica*.

Reproductive and Developmental Toxicity

Achillea millefolium Extract

An ethanol (45%) A millefolium extract (2.8 g/kg/d; 56 times the equivalent of a human dose of 50 mg/kg/d) was not maternotoxic when orally administered to Sprague Dawley rats (n = 5) but caused decreased body weights in fetuses. The dams were orally administered the test material during gestational days (GDs) 1 to 8 or 8 to 15. The dams were killed on GD 20 and necropsied. There was no increase in preimplantation or postimplantation losses. Placental weights were increased in dams treated with achillea millefolium extract on GDs 8 to 15 compared to the water and ethanol controls and on GDs 1 to 8 compared to water control fetuses. Body weights were reduced in fetuses exposed to achillea millefolium extract on GDs 8 to 15 compared to the water controls. There was no difference in the incidence of external or internal malformations.

An aqueous *A millefolium* leaf extract (0.3, 0.6, 1.2 g/kg/d) orally administered to male Wistar rats (n = 10) for 90 days was not toxic nor caused any clinical or behavioral signs, but there was an increase in abnormal sperm in the males in the high-dose group. ²¹ The rats were killed and necropsied after 90 days, focusing on the testes, epididymis, prostate, and seminal vesicles (including coagulating glands). Daily sperm production and number of sperm were not affected. Body weight gain was similar in all groups.

An aqueous *A millefolium* extract (1.0, 5.0, and 10.0 mL/100 mL feed) fed to Oregon-R strain of fruit flies (*Drosophila melanogaster*) resulted in F1 offspring with a dose-dependent increase in the number of malformations.²² There were no changes in the number of offspring.

Achillea Millefolium Flower Extract

An ethanolic *A millefolium* flower extract (200 mg/kg/d) IP administered to male Swiss albino mice (n = 6) for 20 days and an hydroalcoholic extract (300 mg/kg/d) orally administered for 30 days caused exfoliation of immature germ cells, germ cell necrosis, and seminiferous tubule vacuolization.²³ Mice in the treatment groups had an increased number of metaphases in the germ epithelium that might be due to cytotoxic substances or substances stimulating cell proliferation. Neither extract caused any differences in body weight gain or in testis and seminal vesicle weight.

An ethanolic *A millefolium* flower extract (200, 400, 800 mg/kg) IP or orally administered to male albino Wistar rats (n = 5) every other day for 22 days caused no changes in the low-dose IP group and the low- and mid-dose oral groups;

Becker et al

however, there were abnormalities in the development of sperm in the mid- and high-dose groups. ²⁴ There were scattered immature cells on basal membrane in seminiferous tubules in the IP mid-dose group. A decrease in cell accumulation and vacuolization in seminiferous tubules was observed. In the IP high-dose group, thickened seminiferous tubules on basal membrane, decreased cell accumulation in seminiferous tubule, severe disarrangement, degenerative cells, and severe decrease in sperm count were also observed. At the oral high dose, basal membranes were thickened and disarrangement in cells was observed. After a 40-day recovery period, normal physiology was observed in the low- and mid-dose groups compared with controls; however, there continued to be abnormal and damaged cells in the high-dose groups.

Genotoxicity

In Vitro

Achillea millefolium extract. In an Ames test using Salmonella typhimurium (TA98, TA100, TA102, TA1535, TA1537), the mixture containing an aqueous extract of A millefolium (0.06-5 μ L) was not mutagenic with or without metabolic activation.²⁵

In 2 micronucleus tests using V79 cells, the mixture containing an aqueous extract of *A millefolium* (up to 15 000 µg/mL) was not clastogenic or aneugenic with or without metabolic activation. ²⁶ In a gene mutation assay using mouse lymphoma L5178Y TK^{+/-}, a product (up to 5 µL/mL) that contained an aqueous extract of *A millefolium* (0.5%) was not mutagenic with or without metabolic activation. ¹⁶ The controls had the expected results.

Irritation and Sensitization

Irritation

Ocular

Achillea millefolium extract. In an Epiocular Human Cell Construct assay, a product containing a mixture of an extract of *A millefolium* (0.00045%) was found to not have irritation potential.²⁷

Sensitization

Dermal—Nonhuman

Achillea millefolium extract. In a local lymph node assay (LLNA) using mice, a mixture containing an aqueous extract of A millefolium (25%, 50%, and 100% in dimethylformamide) was not a sensitizer. Because this assay was performed on a mixture where the substance of interest was less than 80% of the mixture, the results do not permit a quantitative evaluation of the sensitization potential of achillea millefolium extract. ²⁹

Dermal—Human

Achillea millefolium extract. In a patch test of participants with atopic dermatitis (n = 9), there were no positive reactions to A

millefolium extract (1% in petrolatum).³⁰ Finn chambers were used and the test sites were observed on days 2 and 3.

In a human repeated insult patch test (HRIPT; n = 107), a face moisturizer with self-tanner product containing an extract of *A millefolium* (0.00045%; 0.2 mL) applied neat was not irritating or sensitizing.³¹ The test material was applied to a 2-cm² occlusive patch. There were transient, barely perceptible to mild nonspecific and specific responses, occasionally accompanied by mild/moderate edema or mild dryness in 9 test participants. Five participants had mild hyperpigmentation without erythema during the induction phase.

In an HRIPT (n = 108), a body splash product containing an extract of *A millefolium* (0.001133%) applied neat was not irritating or sensitizing.³² The test material was applied to an occlusive patch and allowed to dry for 20 minutes before administration to the scapula area. There were no adverse events reported. In an HRIPT (n = 53) of a body lotion containing achillea millefolium extract (0.04%), it was concluded that the body lotion was neither irritating nor sensitizing.³³

Clinical Use

Case Studies

A 44-year-old woman with a history of rhinoconjunctivitis and asthma developed rhinitis, asthma, and urticaria symptoms after working seasonally with dried flowers for 6 years. The skin prick test was positive for pollen from *Cupressus sempervirens*, *Olea europaea*, *Lolium perenne*, *Salsola kali*, *Artemisia vulgaris*, and *Parietaria judaica* as well as to cat and dog epithelium. Skin prick tests of aqueous extracts of the dried flowers were positive for *A millefolium* and safflower. An asthmatic response resulted from a specific inhalation bronchial challenge of *A millefolium*.

Summary

This amended safety assessment of *A millefolium* (yarrow)-derived ingredients examines new data submitted to address the needs of the insufficient data conclusion that the Panel reached in the previous safety assessment. These ingredients function in cosmetics as skin-conditioning agents—miscellaneous, skin-conditioning agents—humectants, and fragrance ingredients.

UV absorbance peaked at \sim 260 nm with small shoulders at 270 and 320 nm using a 1% aqueous water extract. Achillea millefolium extract was reported to be used in 134 cosmetic products: 83 leave-on products and 47 rinse-off products with use concentrations up to 0.04% in body and hand skin care products. There was no use information reported for achillea millefolium flower extract and achillea millefolium flower/leaf/stem extract.

A millefolium extract was not cytotoxic to L5178Y cells. The oral LD₅₀ for achillea millefolium extract is >2,000 mg/kg for rats; no mortalities were reported at 10 g/kg. There were

no mortalities to rats administered IP 3 g/kg achillea millefolium extract.

An aqueous *A millefolium* extract was well tolerated by rats at up to 1.2 g/kg/d for up to 90 days. An ethanol extract of a herbal mixture that included *A millefolium* at 3.5% was not toxic to mice when administered orally for up to 6 months. There were no effects to the major organs.

Oral administration of an ethanol *A millefolium* extract was not maternotoxic at 2.8 g/kg/d when administered on GDs 1 to 8 but did cause reduced body weight in the fetuses when administered on GDs 8 to 15. There was no increase in external or internal malformations. The oral administration of an aqueous *A millefolium* leaf extract caused an increase in abnormal sperm at 1.2 g/kg/d in rats. Daily sperm production and number of sperm were not affected. Aqueous *A millefolium* extract caused an increase in the number of malformations in *D melanogaster* offspring.

Achillea millefolium flower extract administered IP caused damage to the reproductive organs of male mice at 300 mg/kg/d. An ethanolic A millefolium flower extract IP or orally administered to male rats every other day for 22 days caused no changes at 200 mg/kg IP and the 200 and 400 mg/kg oral groups. There were abnormalities in the development of sperm in the 400 and 800 mg/kg IP groups. After a 40-day recovery period, there continued to be abnormal and damaged cells in the 800 mg/kg groups.

Achillea millefolium extract was not genotoxic in an Ames test, 2 micronucleus tests, and a gene mutation assay. Achillea millefolium extract was not irritating to subjects with atopic dermatitis at 1%, and an Epiocular Human Cell Construct assay of a product that contained an extract of A millefolium at 0.00045% was negative for ocular irritation.

An aqueous *A millefolium* extract was not a sensitizer in an LLNA at 1%. Two products containing Achillea millefolium extract up to 0.001133% were not sensitizing in HRIPTs. A product containing achillea millefolium extract at 0.04% was neither irritating nor sensitizing. A woman was reported to develop an allergic reaction to *A millefolium* after working with dried flowers.

Discussion

The Panel considered the data from the original 2001 safety assessment of *A millefolium* (yarrow)-derived ingredients in addition to the new data presented in this report. Achillea millefolium extract is reported to be used up to 0.04% in body and hand creams, lotions and powders, and in eye lotion. An LLNA was performed on an aqueous *A millefolium* extract at 1%, and an HRIPT was performed at 0.04%. However, the Panel considered that LLNA testing of mixtures containing a small fraction of any constituent of concern may not reliably predict sensitization. The HRIPT data were available at use concentrations demonstrating an absence of dermal irritation and sensitization.

The Panel expressed concern regarding pesticide residues and heavy metals that may be present in botanical ingredients.

They stressed that the cosmetics industry should continue to use current good manufacturing practices to limit these impurities in the ingredient before blending into cosmetic formulations.

Cosmetic formulations may contain multiple botanical ingredients, each of which can contribute to the total concentration of constituents of concern. For example, the Panel was concerned that cosmetics containing linalool and α-peroxyachifolid may result in sensitization. Other constituents such as thujone, quercetin, and hydroquinone may result in carcinogenicity, genotoxicity, or depigmentation, respectively. The Panel noted that plants in the Asteraceae (formerly Compositae) family, such as A millefolium, are associated with dermal sensitization. Among the constituents of A millefolium plants are linalool (1-4,000 ppm), thujone, quercetin, α-peroxyachifolid, and hydroquinone. Linalool, a dermal sensitizer, is safe up to 4.3%. α -Peroxyachifolid is a dermal sensitizer at 0.01\%. Thujone has been reported to cause neurological toxic effects; the suggested acceptable daily intake was not more than 3 to 7 mg/kg/d. Quercetin has been reported to have some genotoxic effects in in vitro assays but not in oral studies. Hydroquinone has been reported to cause skin depigmentation starting at 0.4%. These constituents are present in the plant. Data show that thujone and other constituents were not present in an extract. The levels of constituents of concern in the cosmetic ingredients derived from plants can vary widely and may even be undetectable in the ingredients, depending on the growing conditions of the plant, the methods of manufacturing of the ingredient, and other factors. The maximum concentration of use of A millefolium-derived extracts in cosmetics was reported to be 0.04%.

The use of other botanical ingredients that may contain constituents of concern (eg, potential sensitizers) in combination with *A millefolium* ingredients in a single formulation could result in exposures that exceed levels of concern. Thus, cosmetic products containing multiple botanical ingredients should be formulated to ensure that total exposures to such constituents remain below the levels of toxicological concern when used as intended. Manufacturers should employ good manufacturing practices to ensure that constituents of concern are below the levels of toxicological concern, including sensitization. It is important for formulators to be aware that even though the assays in this report revealed no sensitizers, these ingredients may still contain sensitizers, such as sesquiterpene lactones. Products that contain such sensitizers need to be formulated at nonsensitizing levels.

The Panel discussed the issue of incidental inhalation exposure from perfumes and face powders. There were no inhalation toxicity data available. However, the Panel believes that the sizes of a substantial majority of the particles of the products containing these ingredients, as manufactured, are larger than the respirable range and/or aggregate and agglomerate to form much larger particles in formulation. However, these ingredients are reportedly used at concentrations up to 0.0001% in cosmetic products that may be aerosolized and up to 0.00005% in other products that may become airborne.

Becker et al 13S

The Panel noted that 95% to 99% of the droplets/particles released from cosmetic sprays have aerodynamic equivalent diameters >10 μm, with propellant sprays yielding a greater fraction of droplets/particles <10 µm compared with pump sprays. Therefore, most droplets/particles incidentally inhaled from cosmetic sprays would be deposited in the nasopharyngeal and thoracic regions of the respiratory tract. Furthermore, droplets/particles deposited in the nasopharyngeal or bronchial regions of the respiratory tract present no toxicological concerns based on the chemical and biological properties of these ingredients. Coupled with the small actual exposure in the breathing zone and the very low concentrations at which the ingredients are used, the available information indicates that incidental inhalation would not be a significant route of exposure that might lead to local respiratory or systemic effects. A detailed discussion and summary of the Panel's approach to evaluating incidental inhalation exposures to ingredients in cosmetic products are available at http://www.cir-safety.org/ cir-findings.

The Panel considered other data available to characterize the potential for *A millefolium*-derived ingredients to cause irritation, sensitization, reproductive and developmental toxicity, and genotoxicity. They noted the lack of systemic toxicity at high doses in acute and subchronic oral exposure studies, no irritation or sensitization at use concentrations in tests of dermal and ocular exposure, as well as the absence of genotoxicity in an Ames test, 2 micronucleus tests, and a gene mutation assay. Although *A millefolium*-derived ingredients caused an increase in abnormal sperm and damage to male organs in rats, these effects were observed at levels much greater than any from exposure to cosmetics.

Conclusion

The CIR Panel concluded that achillea millefolium extract, achillea millefolium flower extract (Note 1), and achillea millefolium flower/leaf/stem extract (Note 1) are safe in the present practices of use and concentration in cosmetics when formulated to be nonsensitizing.

Authors' Note

Unpublished sources cited in this report are available from the Director, Cosmetic Ingredient Review, 1620 L Street, NW, Suite 1200, Washington, DC 20036, USA.

Author contributions

L. C. Becker contributed to conception and design, contributed to acquisition, analysis, and interpretation, and drafted the manuscript. L. J. Gill, F. A. Andersen, W. F. Bergfeld, D. V. Belsito, R. A. Hill, C. D. Klaassen, D. C. Liebler, J. G. Marks, R. C. Shank, T. J. Slaga, and P. W. Snyder contributed to conception and design, contributed to analysis and interpretation, and critically revised the manuscript. All authors gave final approval and agree to be accountable for all aspects of work ensuring integrity and accuracy.

Declaration of Conflicting Interests

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The author(s) disclosed receipt of the following financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article: The articles in this supplement were sponsored by the Cosmetic Ingredient Review. The Cosmetic Ingredient Review is financially supported by the Personal Care Products Council.

Note

 Not in current use. Were the ingredients not in current use to be used in the future, the expectation is that they would be used in product categories and at concentrations comparable to others in the group.

References

- Gottschalck TE, Breslawec HP. International Cosmetic Ingredient Dictionary and Handbook. 14th ed. Washington, DC: Personal Care Products Council; 2012.
- 2. Andersen FA. Final report on the safety assessment of yarrow (*Achillea millefoium*) extract. *Int J Toxicol*. 2001;20(suppl 2): 79-84.
- Wichtl M. Herbal Drugs and Phytopharmaceuticals: A Handbook for Practice on a Scientific Basis. London, UK: Medpharm Scientific Publishers; 1994.
- 4. Hausen BM. The sensitizing capacity of compsitae plants. III. Test results and cross-reactions in compositae-sensitive patients. *Dermatologica*. 1979;159(1):1-11.
- Anonymous. Description of the product: Aqueous extract of Achillea millefolium. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2011.
- Glasl S, Mucaji P, Werner I, Presser A, Jurenitsch J. Sesquiterpenes and flavonoid aglycones from a Hungarian taxon of the *Achillea millefolium* group. Z Naturforsch C. 2002;57(11-12): 976-982. PM:12562079
- Rohloff J, Skagen EB, Steen AH, Iversen TH. Production of yarrow (*Achillea millefolium* L.) in Norway: essential oil content and quality. *J Agric Food Chem*. 2000;48(12):6205-6209. PM: 11312793.
- Candan F, Unlu M, Tepe B, et al. Antioxidant and antimicrobial activity of the essential oil and methanol extracts of *Achillea millefolium* subsp. millefolium Afan. (Asteraceae). *J Ethnopharmacol*. 2003;87(2-3):215-220. PM:12860311.
- Agnihotri VK, Lattoo SK, Thappa RK, et al. Chemical variability in the essential oil components of *Achillea millefolium* agg. from different Himalayan habitats (India). *Planta Med.* 2005;71(3): 280-283. PM:15770553.
- Duke J. Dr. Duke's Phytochemical and Ethnobotanical Databases; Achillea millefolium L.—Asteraceae. http://sun.ars-grin.gov: 8080/npgspub/xsql/duke/plantdisp.xsql?taxon=18. Updated 2012. Accessed October 30, 2012.
- Food and Drug Administration. Frequency of use of cosmetic ingredients. FDA Database. Washington, DC: Food and Drug Administration; 2013.

- 12. Johnsen MA. The influence of particle size. *Spray Technol Mark*. 2004;14(11):24-27.
- 13. Rothe H. Special aspects of cosmetic spray evaluation. Unpublished data presented at the 26 September CIR Expert Panel meeting. Washington D.C.; 2011.
- Bremmer HJ, Prud'homme de Lodder LCH, Engelen JGM. Cosmetics Fact Sheet: to assess the risks for the consumer; Updated version for ConsExpo 4. 2006. Report No. RIVM 320104001/2006. 1-77.
- 15. Rothe H, Fautz R, Gerber E, et al. Special aspects of cosmetic spray safety evaluations: principles on inhalation risk assessment. *Toxicol Lett.* 2011;205(2):97-104.
- 16. Labor L&S AG. Gene mutation assay in mouse lymphoma L5178Y TK+/- cells to trifluorothymidine-resistance with Extrapon 5-UK NEU (contains 0.5% Achillea Millefolium Extract). L+S Study Number: 10383997. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 1998.
- 17. EVIC France. Summary of an acute oral toxicity study in the rat OECD 423 of a mixture containing an aqueous extract of *Achillea millefolium*. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2009.
- Cavalcanti AM, Baggio CH, Freitas CS, et al. Safety and antiulcer efficacy studies of *Achillea millefolium* L. after chronic treatment in Wistar rats. *J Ethnopharmacol*. 2006;107(2):277-284. PM: 16647233.
- Petlevski R, Hadzija M, Slijepcević M, Juretić D. Toxicological assessment of P-9801091 plant mixture extract after chronic administration in CBA/HZg mice—a biochemical and histological study. *Coll Antropol*. 2008;32(2):577-581. PM: 18756913.
- Boswell-Ruys CL, Ritchie HE, Brown-Woodman PD. Preliminary screening study of reproductive outcomes after exposure to yarrow in the pregnant rat. *Birth Defects Res B Dev Reprod Toxicol*. 2003;68(5):416-420. PM:14745991.
- Dalsenter PR, Cavalcanti AM, Andrade AJ, Araujo SL, Marques MC. Reproductive evaluation of aqueous crude extract of *Achillea millefolium* L. (Asteraceae) in Wistar rats. *Reprod Toxicol*. 2004;18(6):819-823. PM:15279880.
- Uysal H, Kara AA, Algur OF, Dumlupinar R, Aydogan MN. Recovering effects of aqueous extracts of some selected medical plants on the teratogenic effects during the development of *D. melanogaster. Pak J Biol Sci.* 2007;10(10):1708-1712. PM: 19086522.
- 23. Montanari T, de Carvalho JE, Dolder H. Antispermatogenic effect of *Achillea millefolium* L. in mice. *Contraception*. 1998;58(5): 309-313. PM:9883387.
- 24. Takzare N, Hosseini MJ, Hamideh MS, Safaie S, Moradi R. The effect of *Achillea millefolium* extract on spermatogenesis of male Wistar rats. *Hum Exp Toxicol*. 2011;30(4):328-334. PM: 20515984.
- 25. Vivotecnia Research SL. Summary of a bacterial reverse mutation assay of a mixture containing an aqueous extract of *Achillea millefolium*. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2009.
- 26. Anonymous. Summary of an *in vitro* micronucleus assay in V79 cells (mixed population method) of a mixture containing an

- aqueous extract of *Achillea millefolium*. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2012.
- 27. Institute for In Vitro Sciences Inc. Topical application ocular irritation screening assay using the Epiocular™ human cell construct of an indoor tanning product containing 0.00045% *Achillea Millefolium* Extract. Study Number: 06AG64, 05AH41.015110. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2006:11.
- 28. Harlan. Summary of a local lymph node assay (LLNA) in mice of a mixture containing an aqueous extract of *Achillea millefolium*. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2009.
- 29. Lalko J, Api AM. Investigation of the dermal sensitization potential of various essential oils in the local lymph node assay. *Food Chem Toxicol*. 2006;44(5):739-746.
- Jovanovic M, Poljacki M, Duran V, Vujanovic L, Sente R, Stojanovic S. Contact allergy to Compositae plants in patients with atopic dermatitis. *Med Pregl.* 2004;57(5-6):209-218. PM: 15503788.
- 31. RTCS Inc. Clinical safety evaluation human repeated insult patch test (HRIPT) of an indoor tanning product containing 0.00045% *Achillea Millefolium* extract. RCTS Study No. 2114. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2006.
- Clinical Research Laboratories Inc. Repeated insult patch test of a body and hand spray containing 0.001133% *Achillea Millefolium* Extract. CRL Study Number: CRL41409-2. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2009.
- 33. Anonymous. HRIPT on a body lotion containing 0.04% *Achillea Millefolium* Extract. Unpublished data submitted by Personal Care Products Council; 2007:3.
- 34. Compes E, Bartolome B, Fernandez-Nieto M, Sastre J, Cuesta J. Occupational asthma from dried flowers of Carthamus tinctorious (safflower) and Achillea millefolium (yarrow). *Allergy*. 2006; 61(10):1239-1240. PM:16942580.
- Bickers D, Calow P, Greim H, et al. A toxicologic and dermatologic assessment of linalool and realated esters when used as fragrance ingredients. *Food Chem Toxicol*. 2003;41(7): 919-942.
- 36. Bio-Botanica, Inc. Definition of thujone. Unpublished data submitted by the Cosmetic, Toiletry, and Frangrance Association; 1998:1.
- 37. National Toxicology Program. NTP Technical Report on the toxicology and carcinogenesis studies of α,β-thujone (CAS No. 76231-76-0) in F34.N rats and B6C3F1 mice. (Gavage studies). Durham, NC: Research Triangle Park; 2011:1-265. Report No. NTP TR 570/NIH Publication No. 12-5912. http://ntp.niehs.nih.gov/ntp/htdocs/LT_rpts/TR570.pdf.
- Höld KM, Sirisoma NS, Ikeda T, Narahashi T, Casida JE. á-Thujone (the active component of absinthe): γ-Aminobutyric acid type A receptor modulation and metabolic detoxification. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2000;97(8):3826-3831.
- 39. Olsen RW. Absinethe and γ-aminobutyric acid receptors. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. 2000;97(9):4417-4418.
- Padosch SA, Lachenmeier DW, Kröner LU. Absinthism: a fictitious 19th century syndrom with present impact. Subst Abuse Treat Prev Policy. 2006;1:14

Becker et al

- 41. Dettling A, Grass H, Schuff A, Skopp G, Strohbeck-Kuehner P, Haffner HT. Absinthe: attention performance and mood under the influence of thujone. *J Stud Alcohol Drugs*. 2004;65(5): 573-581.
- 42. International Programme on Chemical Safety. Toxicological Evaluation of Certain Food Additives: Twenty-Fifth Report of the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives. Geneva, Switzerland: International Programme on Chemical Safety. 1981. 227-233.
- Poginsky B, Westendorf N, Prosenc N, Kuppe M, Marquardt H. St. John's wort (*Hypericum perforatum* L.). Genotoxicity induced by quercetin content. *Deutsche Apotheker Zeitung*. 1988;128: 13464-13466.
- 44. Harwood M, Danielewska-Nikiel B, Borzelleca JF, Flamm GW, Williams GM, Lines TC. A critical review of the data related to the safety of quercetin and lack of evidene of *in vivo* toxicity, including lack of genotoxic/carcinogenic properties. *Food Chem Toxicol*. 2007;45(11):2179-2205.
- 45. Andersen FA, Bergfeld WF, Belsito DV, et al. Final amended safety assessment of hydroquinone as used in cosmetics. *Int J Toxicol*. 2010;29(suppl 4):274S-287S.
- 46. Hausen BM, Breuer J, Weglewski J, Rucker G.Alphaperoxyachifolid and other new sensitizing sesquiterpene lactones from yarrow (*Achillea millefolium* L., Compositae). *Contact Dermatitis*. 1991;24(4):274-280. PM:1868717.